

UACES 45th Annual Conference

Bilbao, 7-9 September 2015

Conference papers are works-in-progress - they should not be cited without the author's permission. The views and opinions expressed in this paper are those of the author(s).

www.uaces.org

Agnieszka Laskowska
Department of Local Development and Policy
Faculty of Geography and Regional Studies
University of Warsaw
0048225520650

City Governments in the Internationalisation Processes: Case Studies from France and Poland

Abstract The aim adopted in the paper is to determine which one of the factors: political, administrative or financial has a more important influence on the attitudes of local governments in the internationalisation processes. The reasoning presented in this paper is based on a study referring to the quantitative and qualitative methods of analysis. These were the analysis of the official documents, databases and in-depth interviews. The study was conducted in one of the Polish cities – Lublin and in one of the French cities – Nancy.

In this paper the issues related to the role of the leader in cooperation, the process of learning institutions and the importance of financial factors for international actions by local governments are described. In addition, it addresses the issues related to the legislation regulations in the international activity of local government in Poland and France.

It was determined that the attitudes of local governments in cooperation depend greatly on political factors. Moreover, the executive body has the most important impact on a cooperation on the international arena. Both in Lublin and in Nancy case, despite on the differences in political and administrative systems, the nature, activity, range and deepness of the existing cooperation depend more on mayor's capacity and attitude than councilors' or clerks'. Nancy's mayor strives to make the best use of the existing links, while Lublin's mayor expanding cooperation to new cities wants to strengthen its image on the international arena.

Keywords: internationalization, cross-border cooperation, local government, France, Poland, Nancy, Lublin

The phenomenon of international (cross-border) cooperation is common in European local governments. Running international activities by local governments is possible through the process of decentralization. The delegation of certain tasks and obligations from the state to the local government has increased the autonomy in the conduct of international action and empowered local governments in international discourse as well. Due to the granted autonomy beyond national scale and national legislative regulations, European local governments doing their dealings adopt different positions. This article attempts to determine which factors political or administrative has a decisive role and influence on the attitudes of municipal governments in cross-border cooperation in Poland and France. A detailed research was carried out in the Polish city Lublin and its French partner.

The idea of establishing direct and permanent contacts between municipalities was created after the end of II World War. It had to break and reduce damages and barriers which had been developed between nations in results of hostilities. It was observed that the main role in this initiative should have been played by local communities that were not involved in “the Great Politics” at the state level and had a strong desire to rebuild and remove the losses and effects of warfare quickly. The first official twinning agreement was established between

hostile to each other cities: French - Montbelliard and German - Ludwigsburg in 1947 [Hałas, Porawski, 2003].

With the expansion of collaborative networks of cities, found out that cities' collaboration constitute one of a crucial element for development of European integration and relations between residents in different states form the good basis for building a common Europe [Brzozowska, 1998]. Currently, there are territorial units in every European country cooperating with foreign entities. In 2003, only between 15 "Old" EU countries, there were over 7,000 formal partnerships [Hałas, Porawski, 2003]. In Poland, the number of twinning municipalities began to steadily increase after 1990 [Brzozowska, 1998]. In 2012, the partnership agreement was signed by approx. 95% urban and 52% rural communities [Fuksiewicz, Łada, Wenerski, 2012]. In the case of Poland, relations between local government units are diverse, from ad-hoc activities and spontaneous projects up to strict and organized cooperation [Szewczyk, 2007].

Cross-border cooperation, local leadership and learning organization

Due to the lack of a clear definition concerning cross-border cooperation in national and international legal acts, it is important to clarify applied terms precisely. For the purposes of this article, the cross-border cooperation is defined interchangeably to the international cooperation. Both terms should be understood as mutual and interconnected relations basing on cooperation that is a joint action, which brings benefits to stakeholders [Szmigiel-Rawska, 2008]. These relations work on the basis of written legal agreements between the territorial units of different countries. They are often defined interchangeably as foreign partnership, and also as twinning cities/relations. According to some views, twinning relations, are defined as international contacts of local authorities characterized by the direct involvement of residents of a territorial unit and a local organization in cooperation with foreign communities [on the basis of Szewczyk, 2007]. The increased interest in cross-border cooperation by local governments is associated with fast advance of globalization. Globalization brings about inter alia changes in the functioning of states, societies, science and culture. The process has caused disorders in the unity of the state, the nation and space. The state lost its monopoly in the political sphere. New relations in power and competition have occurred, the number of international actors have increased and importance of paradiplomacy escalating. The state, similar to local governments, has become one of many actors in "transnational game" [Cieśla, 2000]. The concept of the "municipal internationalism" by N. Clarke [2010] arose from this trend. The author points out that the functioning of local governments on an increasing scale depends on the decisions taken abroad. In the fact, a location of actors who were making these

decisions outside the country resulted that local governments had no influence on decisions that directly concern them. Consequently, they began to form international organizations bringing together local governments in the '70s. Local governments were bringing together within the framework of international organizations, because only then their voice was more important and more audible in the international arena. The desire to gain a stronger position on the over-national level forced to increase local authorities' involvement in cross-border cooperation. The involvement degree of each local governments will depend on a scale of entrepreneurship of local authorities and individual features of their leader. The local politics, including policy concerning cross-border cooperation, involves a lot of actors. Many of them carries out their activities in a distinctive and visible way to the local community, engaging their personal resources such as time, experience and money. Moreover, more enterprising actors use the possibilities and opportunities perfectly that exist in their environment. Local "politician - entrepreneur" behaves in the political environment similarly to entrepreneurs in the business environment. Theories about the political entrepreneurship show a high efficiency of this method using to accomplish local politics. At the same time, they pay attention to four attributes that should characterize enterprising politicians (those qualities can occur in every person with varying intensity, but each of them, even in the slightest degree should be presented). Political entrepreneurs distinguishing features include: a social acuity enables understanding of others and initiating easily discussions and capturing opened "window of opportunity"; team building - a political entrepreneur is the creator of ideas, but has to work with others to implement them effectively; defining problems - allowing to identify problems early and find their resolution, and leading by example – consists in independent implementation of enterprising politicians' ideas and presentation of their results [Mintron, Norman, 2009]. Theories about political entrepreneurship outline the personality of political entrepreneur, who has some distinguishing features allowing for identifying him with the figure of a local leader. According to network's theories, the leader is an entity that gives impetus to joint actions and involvement of a local government, and determines exchange of information [Szmigiel-Rawska, Dziemianowicz, Szlachta, 2010]. According to K. Szmigiel-Rawska and S. Dołzbłasz [2012] importance of leadership can be linked directly with the Hindmoor's views on the determining factors in cooperation. Hindmoor identified hallmarks of the "excellent cooperation" that should distinguish entities involved in cooperation (Estimation, Enthusiasm and Initiative). According to the authors, these features can be achieved in the organization only if its actions are directed by a person who has a strong authority and power to release desired traits among persons committed to the projects.

However, according to Hermann [1998] leadership process is never the same. Determining factors for leader's behaviour never gives the same effects. A multitude of factors influencing the role of leader and approaches to the analysis of this issue have developed a number of theories relating to leadership that emphasize crucial importance of leadership in an organization. Theories of leadership are focusing on personal qualities of leaders which define a leader as a person who indicates goals for his supporters and tempting them to follow him. In this approach, the taken goals and ways depend on a leader. Leadership theories, which consider the leadership as a variety of transactions and the exchange treat the leader as an independent trader. Being a leader requires sensitivity to needs of the people and strive to satisfy them. The leader responds to the needs and desires of the masses, while convincing them that only he is able to help them to meet their demands. On the other hand, external attribution leadership theories consider a leader like a puppet. The leader is controlled by his supporters, who create his strength and direction for his actions. The leader, as representative of his supporters' group, acts on its behalf and reflects its objectives. In these theories, the leader is "a mirror of his surroundings". Theories focused on social determinants of leadership say that leadership is as "a fight at the front". Leadership becomes a reaction to changes appearing in a social environment [Hermann, 1998]. M. Kotras [2008] points out that leadership is also related to intentionality of human action. It depends on the shape, expectations and needs of the community, which are determined by its cultural characteristics. This leader is responsible for the "world decisions of the community." A similar conclusion leads "House's Paths' Theory". It assumes that a leader is a person indicating courses of action and supporting subordinates in achieving the objectives set by him [Stoner, Freeman, Gilbert Jr., 2001]. Blondel [1987] claims that leader's goals are consequences of individual specific vision of his role. According to him, this vision can take two forms. The general one, which is a general plan of action, or it may take the form of the ideology that defines what and how should the whole things make.

Apart from the figure of a leader, for the functioning of local government "the administrative background" is important. The authority should seek to strengthen their abilities permanently to shape their future through increased involvement of employees in the process of improvement. According to the theory of a learning organization, employees are the engine and originators of changes occurring in the organization. Learning organization is distinguished by teamwork, which strengthens synergies' effects. Senge's concept assumes that if the team is able to learn, the organization also will learn [Kocot, 2006]. Dissemination of knowledge in the office is one of the determinants of the learning organization. In the

social sciences internalisation is understood as: "the process of taking over from the environment in an organized or spontaneous way, certain patterns of conduct or values in force within the community" [Konstańczak, 2001] and consider them as their own [Lexicon PWN, 1972]. The internalisation of knowledge lies on "joining available knowledge in hidden one and learning by doing. This is the process of indirect experience acquired through the experience of others"[Galata, 2004]. Thus, the internalization of knowledge in administrative structures will apply to distribution, expansion of information between the various departments of the office and creation of new solutions based on available knowledge. The internalisation of knowledge about the effects of cooperation in the office translates also into a wider range of opportunities that have officials and the diffusion of this knowledge outside to the residents. The involvement of the whole office results in the availability of complementary tools and competence of individual departments in an office and an increase in quality of jobs and services. In the case when international cooperation is committed to only one cell or a person, the range of available options is much narrower.

Research methods

In this research, I have analysed and used: legislation, reports on international cooperation of local governments in Poland and France; results of research on international cooperation Polish local governments; Lublin and Nancy's web sites; documents relating to Nancy and Lublin's international cooperation.

To achieve a more complete picture of cross-border cooperation between discussed cities, analysis of literature and available data from the Internet were supplemented by an analysis of available documents from the Archives of the City of Nancy and interviews with representatives of Nancy and Lublin. The data in the Archives concerning international cooperation of Nancy are incomplete due to the Archives' deficiencies.

The comparison of legislative conditions for conducting cross-border cooperation

The degree of decentralization of power in the country has significant impact on the attitudes of local governments in their actions [see Kersting, Vetter, 2003; Wollmann, Bouckaert, 2006]. It affects directly the law regulating the scope of independence of local government. Determination of differences arising from the structure of local governments and national legal acts regulating their functioning in Poland and France has helped to identify and compare the role of the analyzed in the article factors and the level of independence of Polish and French communities in international activities.

The first factor, distinguishing these two local governments, is the degree of political parties' involvement in and importance for the local government system. The political parties'

involvement degree, in French local government, is one of the largest in Europe, while in Polish one is the least. The weakness of political parties in Poland at the municipal level is connected with the general crisis of their concept and role in Poland, e.g. resulting from a lack of public confidence to political parties. Another factor contributing to the low importance of political parties at local level is the structure of local government reform in Poland. Its authors claimed that political parties should not penetrate the municipal level. In their view, the municipalities should be governed by local civic organizations not by political parties. They believe that local organizations opposed to the political parties want to solve local problems, and not to use them in the struggle for gaining power in the country [Gendźwiłł, Żółtak 2012]. However in practice, the conducted analyses among others by A. Gendźwiłł and T. Żółtak [2012] and A. Ptak [2011], show that the political parties strengthen their position in Polish local arena in recent years. This is due to seeking a balance between the strongest local non-partisan committees and political parties during local elections [Gendźwiłł, Żółtak 2012]. According to A. Ptak, increasing role of political parties in Poland is linked to the enlargement of the competence of local governments and equipping them with instruments of management that are attractive to enlarge the influence of political parties and participation in social life. In France, the construction of local electoral systems¹ and the use of mechanisms that promote political parties like blocking lists or electoral thresholds in voting common council led to the division of the local political scene into blocks: the left and right. This causes an existence of local election coalitions of candidates who represent parties with similar programs [Wójtowicz, 2008]. Analyses of French local election results shown in other political phenomena occurring at the state level were also transferred to municipal level, e.g. increasing importance of ecological party [Martin, 2001].

Another difference between local governments in both countries refers to the average size of the municipality. Polish municipalities are large units but French - small. The size of municipalities is connected directly with the scope of their functions and freedom to perform their actions. In January 2013, the number of municipalities in Poland amounted to 2 479 [GUS], while in France approx. 37 000 [INSEE]. This situation is due to the fact that in France the division into municipalities came down to recognize the "naturally existing" human communities (settlements) and not the artificial division of the country. The

¹ In the municipalities up to 3500 inhabitants, the council is elected in the majority elections system and elections are held in two rounds. Constituency is a municipality. In municipalities of more than 3,500 inhabitants, there are the mixed proportional-majority elections system, and the municipality is divided into constituencies [Vital-Durand, 2000].

consequence of this action was to give French units, at a later time, the status of *collectivités territoriales* (territorial communities) with legal personality of public law [Urban, 2006].

The role of the executive body and the legislative body in the Polish and French municipality is different. In Poland, the executive is elected in direct elections and has political responsibility before the council and residents (it can be cancelled by referendum at the request of the council or residents). Moreover, the mayor's activities are controlled by a legislative organ. However, as research indicates, municipal councillors' checks competency are depletion by the dominance of the executive body [Bober and other, 2013]. Executive authority in Polish local government may be revoked by the Prime Minister at the request of the minister responsible for the administration but cannot be cancelled or suspended directly by the Minister of Administration. French mayors of large cities are called "local monarchs". The use of this term in the context of the determination of the executive body in France proves its strong position in local government [Wollmann, 2012]. Under French law, the mayor is elected by the members of the municipal council at the first meeting of the council. Elected mayor is also the chairman of the municipal council. Often in big cities, the mayor, who is an important figure in a political party at the local level, is located on the top of the electoral list and have an impact on the shape of this list [Borraz, 2000; John, Cole, 2000]. Moreover, the executive body in French community does not have political responsibility before the council and residents. French mayor's role in local government is also strengthened by the fact that simultaneously he is a representative of local government and *l'agent de l'Etat* (State representative in the commune) [Borraz, 2000]. As a representative of the state in the municipality, he performs the tasks of the registrar's office and is *l'officier de Police Judiciaire* (judicial officer). As *l'officier de Police Judiciaire* he possessed its own powers relating to maintenance of order and security in the territorial unit e.g exercises control over the security forces (police and *gendarmerie nationale* operating on the commune territory) [CGCT Art. L2122-31]. In France, there is the phenomenon of *cumul des mandats* (joining seats), which allows to combine the mandate of the mayor, among others, with government mandates. The effect is that executive authority in local government obtains the possibility of use immunity [Wollmann, 2000]. Another phenomenon of strengthening positions of the mayor in local government, and at the same time binding him directly with the central government, is the way the appeal of the executive. The council neither residents do not have the opportunity to appeal the mayor. Even if, he is revoked by a judgment of the administrative court, he doesn't lose a local councillor post. What's more, the mayor may be suspended in his duties directly by the Minister of Administration.

The municipal council in Poland is the organ of controlling the mayor of the city activities. It has a political instrument to assess the activities of the executive body - discharge for the local budget. The municipal council may also submit an application for the dismissal of the mayor in a referendum. But the municipal council can be terminated by the Prime Minister or suspended at the request of the minister responsible for the administration by the Prime Minister. The council may also be revoked by a local referendum, at the request of residents. In France, the municipal council is a body which constitutes and controls the mayor within performing tasks assigned by the council. The municipal council has no rights to appeal the chosen (by itself) mayor. The Council can only be resolved by a decree of the Council of Ministers, in cases where there is the phenomenon significantly hindering the functioning of municipalities - like a conflict between the council and the mayor or the lost of capacity to manage municipal affairs. Its activity can also be suspended for a month by the prefect in emergencies as well².

The differences and similarities between municipal governments in Poland and France, under the national legislation, affect the overall scope of the freedom of action of local government. Thus they translate into cross-border cooperation as one of the home business communities. The strong position of executive body in both local governments makes the leader have a dominant opinion in framing the vision and directions of activities of local government. Differences, in the degree of party activity in Polish and French local governments and the method for selecting the local authorities, determine some kind of relations or lack them between the executive body and legislative body in the community. Eg. the realization of ideas of the executive body is easier when it has a majority in the municipal council, which is a common phenomenon in French local governments, because of the mayor selecting way. Moreover, Polish municipal council has rights to control and influence mayor of the city's activities. In contrast, the size of municipal entities is associated with the function of their authority, (ceremonial functions vs. responsibility for providing public services), and their range of responsibilities and way of management. The small size of French communes, on the one hand, limits their activities on the international arena (small municipalities don't have adequate resources to carry out international operations themselves), on the other hand, experience from generated different forms of local cooperation could be also transferred to the international ground.

² Description of differences in Polish and French local government was based on the following acts: *Code Générale des Collectivités Territoriales (CGCT)*, *circulaire INT/A/91 00 108 C*; *Konstytucja RP z dn. 2 kwietnia 1997r. Dz. U. 1997 nr 78 poz. 483*, *Ustawa z dnia 15 września 2000r. o referendum lokalnym Dz.U. 2000 nr 88 poz. 985*, *Ustawa z dnia 8 maja 1990r. o samorządzie gminnym*

The impact of the granted remit in international relations on the municipalities' independence.

Activities in the international domain, in addition to system solutions, are also shaped by international and national legislation relating to cross-border cooperation. International legal acts have a general nature and create a framework for this type of cooperation, while national legislation lays down in detail the rights and obligations relating to international cooperation of municipalities.

There are fundamental differences in the degree of autonomy of local governments in conducting international activities in Poland and France³. French legislation, unlike Polish one, defines the purpose of cooperation and the conditions that have to be met in order to recognizing by the state the agreement concluded between the local entities. The French local government units may agree to cooperate within the approved agreement with foreign local governments to achieve the aim of which is defined as “the realization of common interest”, in the framework of mutual responsibility. In addition to “the common interest”, French governments in their actions may lead by their own goals of "local interest", such as: economic, tourist or cultural promotion. The law allows, moreover, to conduct cooperation in economic development assistance and humanitarian relief nature. French regulations define the rules that collaboration agreement has to be met to be recognized by the state. The agreement requires, among others things, precise definition of the subject of cooperation and the anticipated amount of financial liabilities to the French side after signing the contract, it cannot also contain features which combine, without an explicit consent, other local governments, not be the subject of the signed contract or France as the State.

Polish local governments have the right to participate in international associations within limits of their power, remit and duties (under the general clause). They have to obey and act in accordance with Polish domestic law, the State's foreign policy and taken, by the Government of the Republic of Poland, international obligations. In accordance with the Law on Local Government, cooperation with local communities of other countries is own task of Polish community. French local governments lead international cooperation within its competence, without prejudice to provisions of the Constitution and other legislation or other international obligations of France. They make also benefits from a general clause, it gives them the right

³ In Poland, the legal acts governing the scope of international cooperation of local government shall be: *Konstytucja RP z dn. 2 kwietnia 1997r. Dz. U. 1997 nr 78 poz. 483, Ustawa z dnia 15 września 2000r. o referendum lokalnym Dz.U. 2000 nr 88 poz. 985, Ustawa z dnia 8 maja 1990r. o samorządzie gminnym. In France, international cooperation is regulate by: Code Générale des Collectivités territoriales, la loi de Thiollière of 2007, La loi Oudin – Sautini of 7.12.2006, Circulaire NOR / INT / B / 01/00124 / C bis of 20.04.2001 and circulaire NOR / INT / B / 01/00124 / C of 04.21.2001*

to engage in all areas of local interests concerning the territorial community. The law stipulates that the use of the general clause can't affect the power or remits of another territorial community or influence on the state power or ignore any prohibitions imposed by the legislature.

In order to Polish municipality will join the international association or any twinning agreements, its council has to take the appropriate decision usually in the form of a resolution. The resolution on cooperation with local and regional communities of other countries or joining local and regional international associations lies in the exclusive jurisdiction of the municipal council. Then, the resolution, together with the opinion of the Governor of Province, is forwarded to the Minister of Foreign Affairs, which issues the final approval to join the union/association etc. Any change of goals or principles of the signed agreement on cooperation within the local associations is related with the obligation to publish a new resolution by the municipal council regarding further participation. In France, the cooperation agreement comes into force when it is delivered to the state representative in the department, who checks its legality. To being accepted one of the cooperation agreement copies has to be written in French. In addition, it has to include an attestation said that French signatory had the right to conclude the relevant agreement.

There are several provisions in French legislation concerning specific regulations on international cooperation of local governments - e.g. identified seven principles that international cooperation cannot concern (among them are the principle of the indivisibility of the Republic and sovereignty of France). The French community also has the right to issue a maximum of 1% of income from water supply and purification, gas and electricity distribution for cooperation (regulated by written agreements), giving a relief in crisis situations on foreign territorial units in the field of water supply and purification and gas and electricity distribution. Most of the abilities that the legislature gives the French territorial unit, in the context of cross-border cooperation, bind to the detailed definition of commitments, time and costs will be incurred by the French local government.

Another difference, between the concerned countries, is establishment in France, the *Commission nationale de la coopération décentralisée* (National Commission for Decentralised Cooperation). The commission shall ensure international cooperation of French local governments and takes action related to its better and more effective functioning. Additionally, within the Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs, there is the "Delegation for the external action of territorial communities". This unit collects and analyzes information regarding external activities of local government and ensure consistency between actions of

the State and territorial communities. Polish legislation does not provide for establishment of institutions tasked with organizing and supervising the course and activities of local governments international cooperation.

As is apparent from the analysis of national legislation, Polish provisions on international cooperation of municipalities seem general. Such situation leaves a lot of questions to be decided at the discretion of municipalities. By contrast, in France, most of the issues related to the international cooperation of municipalities have regulated and defined by the legislation at the central level.

Nancy and Lublin

The Research was conducted in Polish city - Lublin and in French city - Nancy, which is the first Lublin's foreign partner -the partnership agreement between the studied cities was signed in 1988.

Lublin is located in eastern Poland. The city is the capital of Lubelskie Province and an important academic centre in the country and in the region. Lublin has established relations with more than 32 foreign cities. Despite the large number of signed formal partnerships, the city is active in cooperation, over the last few years, with each of its partners, Lublin implemented at least one project. The largest group of Lublin's twin cities are the Ukrainian ones. Analyzing the geographical development of international cooperation of Lublin, we can see some characteristic for Polish local governments - two-stage framework of international contacts. The 90's were characterized by an increase in contacts with local authorities from the countries of Western Europe, and since the beginning of the twenty-first century, there has been an increase of partnerships with local governments from Eastern European countries. Polish city's cooperation takes place mostly in the fields of culture and education, but also, depending on the partner ability: in fields related to the functioning of local government, sports and the economy. In cooperation with eastern cities, Lublin also implemented a lot of projects relating to the INTERREG and PHARE programs. The most common form of contacts in Lublin's cross-border cooperation are the working visits in the framework of joint projects, the City Offices' delegation visits, participation in seminars and conferences organized by partners, trade missions, exchange of experiences etc.

Nancy is a city located in eastern France, the second largest city in the region of Lorraine and the capital of the department of Meurte-et-Moselle. It is an important academic regional centre. Nancy has signed twinning agreements with 8 cities from 8 countries. The first partnership was established by Nancy in the 50s but the last contract was signed in 1991. Among its partners, the city does not have any partners from the eastern European countries.

Nancy is cooperating in a wide range of subjects: education, culture, environmental protection, medicine, new technologies and the fight against organized crime. The most common actions undertaken on an international scale is exchange of City Offices' delegations, participation in economic events, conferences organized by partners, exchange of experts and experiences.

Factors influencing the attitudes of Nancy Lublin in cross-border cooperation

The attitudes of local governments in cross-border cooperation to the greatest extent depend on political factors. The greatest impact on international cooperation has executive authority. The nature of the existing policy and cooperation, both in Lublin and in Nancy, depends on this entity. In Lublin, international cooperation is directed by the mayor of the city. This entity outlines directions to international actions, has the final word on the determination of the shape of cooperation and shall be informed on any international actions and their scale undertaken by different departments of the City Office. Nancy's international activities are the result of cooperation between the mayor, councillors and administration. Each of the above bodies are involved in conducting cooperation. However, the mayor is a key player in the decision making process. His political will creates space for administration and gives direction to its activities. He gives instructions to bureaucracy and decides finally on pulling newcomers to international cooperation with the city. French mayor is responsibility ultimately for international actions, and every action within this domain requires his approval. Significant influence of the executive on the shape of international cooperation is visible in the foreign policy adopted by both cities. Nancy strives for making the best use of existing connections. The city develops and deepens cooperation within the framework of existing partnerships, and not to acquire new partners. On the other hand, Lublin expanding cooperation with new cities, wants to strengthen its image and present itself on the international stage. This is due to the general opinion that "Lublin likes to get something to happen" and willingness to distance from the prevailing common stereotype placing Lublin in so-called "Poland B-class". Geographical directions and areas of cooperation are also linked to the person holding executive functions. The proof of this are, among others, observed by changes in the guiding areas of cooperation and the forms of international initiatives of the city. In Lublin, changes in international cooperation are linked to changes at the position of mayor of Lublin. The orientation of cross-border cooperation is appointed usually by personal interests of mayors. Most often, they intensify cooperation in the areas in which they "feel confident". The current mayor of Lublin emphasis on the development of contacts in partnership with southern eastern European countries (Balkans). This is because of the

outlined, in the current term, vision of the city development as a strong centre of eastern competences. As a result of the vision and policy adopted by the current mayor of Lublin since 2010, the international cooperation has taken more project character. Currently, conducted cross-border cooperation is also more diverse and branched, than it was during previous mayors. In Nancy, changes in the international cooperation is often associated with the amendment of mindset and priorities of the former mayor, who held the office for 31 years (until March 2014.). The attitude of the mayor evolved under the influence of various events such as participation in conferences. It is worth noting that only directions of cooperation of Nancy were changed, but the overall policy to international cooperation has remained the same for 31 years - favouring just existing relations, without increasing in the number of partnerships.

The mayor of Lublin is in most cases the author of proposed international initiatives. He clarifies usually the general idea of the project. Lublin's international actions are the result of an own-initiative of other officials as well. It happens that the ideas of cross-border operations run down to the office from various institutions such as: universities and/or business organizations. In Nancy, authors of international projects are usually: mayor, councillors, officials and local associations. The French City Hall is responsible for the creation and implementation of projects. The decision-making process in France is longer than in Poland. This is due to preserving the principle of hierarchy. All applications and other received documents related to international cooperation are directed to the mayor, who forwards them direct to the department responsible for cross-border cooperation or consults them with numerous departments, then he transmits them to the department responsible for cross-border cooperation.

The influence of the executive body for cooperation is also confirmed by analysis of the relations between the electoral cycle and the election of the executive. In the case of Lublin, especially in the years of local elections, we observe an increase of international initiatives in areas where effects are directly affected by residents and associated with positive perception of authority by potential voters, and a decline in foreign trips of City Hall representatives. Foreign trips are related with expenditures, so they are criticized and not perceived by the citizens positively. Nancy does not notice above mentioned dependence. But, in France, the increase of international initiatives with partners is observed in the years jubilee of the partnership.

In both cities, the city council is a body with the least involvement in the international cooperation process. In Lublin, the city council has no effect on international actions, which is

the consequence of councillors' passivity in this area, and not a lack of tools. Its role is limited to approve resolutions concerning the adoption of cooperation, which usually are accepted unanimously, and participation in the foreign delegations or other events linked with cross-border cooperation. It is worth noting, that councillors' participation in the above-mentioned projects is not their own initiative but the response to "the City Hall's invitation". Limited councillors' influence on cooperation is proven by the fact that in Lublin there is no committee for international affairs. Moreover, councillors receive a report concerning the foreign trips of officials and the executive every month, but it does not include specific actions taken by them. Very rarely, they are also the initiators of international projects of Lublin. In the case of Nancy, the council's influence for cooperation is visible, but it is the smallest in comparison with the mayor's one and the officials. All ideas concerning international actions are presented to the committee (consisting of councillors). The commission discusses the shape of the project, revise it if required. Then, the council approves or rejects the project. Each share of international cooperation has to be adopted in the form of a decision at the municipal level. The exceptions are projects ordered or implemented in the framework of projects, commissioned by the Ministry.

In Lublin and Nancy administrative factors are the second one after policies that concern the attitudes of local governments in cross-border cooperation. Officials are second bodies engaged in international cooperation, after the mayors. They are obligate to realise activities under the criteria set by the leader (the mayor). Administrative factors are closely linked with the tools used in the process of international cooperation. The analysis of collected data shows clearly that Nancy uses more advanced tools in cross-border cooperation. There are many reasons for this. Firstly, an approach to collaboration in the City Hall. In Nancy the international cooperation is regarded as an important domain of local government activities and office is engaged constantly. In the city, the office acts as the first body to which the resident asks wishing to utilize in any way, the existence of the twinning relations. In Nancy, there is no cooperation outside of the office, even though residents of the city, who are authors of numerous international initiatives, are very willing to engage in the international action. The active participation of the local community in international cooperation caused that the office often acts as a liaison between the local French community and the community of a foreign partner city. Residents report to the office of Nancy, which contacts the office in a foreign partner city, and it with its local community. The feedback goes in the same way. The socialization of cross-border cooperation meant that the office creates a variety of tools, which in result allow citizens to reap benefits from cooperation carried out by the city.

Among others, these tools relate to a financial aid, granted by citizens, for example: co-financing students staying on different types of internships in the partner city, help to find an internship or a flat in the partner city. The participation of residents in cooperation, in Nancy, is also seen as the best form of fighting against extremism. This translates into a low support in the urban areas for extremists from right-wing national movements that achieve a greater importance at local and central France. Residents participate frequently in so-called "small actions", which are very important locally, but barely visible by the central state level. Besides the "small actions", international importance for the city are also so-called "big projects". These projects are funded by grants, usually commissioned by the ministry, so such actions are mostly visible to the central level. This is important for the city, because it allows for shaping the city's image in France and in Europe. Activities in the implementation of major projects give the possibility of the city's promotion. What's more, the city presenting his experience during national and international conferences usually refers to and talks about its foreign partners, thus create their positive image and "pulled them" in a wider network of international connections. In Lublin, residents are beneficiaries of international projects, but their involvement is minimal. International activities of the city are to create benefits for Lublin's residents. Residents feel the effects of these actions, but they didn't initiate them. Individuals seeking information on established international relations, for example students from Lublin looking for studies in one of the partner cities, do not advantage from the City Hall assistance. Additionally, international cooperation by itself is seen as a minor domain for local government activities. It is believed that the local government does not have to animate cooperation, it may occur outside of the office and the local government. This approach results that in Lublin there is independent (from the City Hall) international cooperation of various entities within organizations from twin towns. Sometimes, the office assists and supports some international initiatives of various institutions, e.g. by providing equipment or translating of documents.

Another issue, that has affected shaping of specialized tools for international cooperation in Nancy, is the office organizational structure that is especially conducive to internalize knowledge and expertise of City Hall. In France, an initiative on the specific level of implementation is dealt with a specialized department. It is not like in Lublin that an initiative from the beginning to the end is coordinating by the international relations department only, which, if appropriate, cooperates with other departments in office. In Nancy, where the scope of knowledge or competence of a given department is insufficient, another department acquires project which is specialized in this field. In consequence, the foreign partner of

Nancy works at various stages of the project directly with diverse office's departments. This structure allows for the best execution of the project and the relief of an international cooperation department. As a result, the entire office is involved in international cooperation of the city and it is able to perform larger numbers of projects with foreign partners. The structure of the office in Nancy encouraging to build a learning organization, because it promotes transmission of information and intensified cooperation between departments. In Lublin, we also deal with cooperation and transfer of information, which leads to internalize knowledge within the City Hall. However, the structure in which one department is constantly involved in the project, hinders functioning of the office and limits the scope of the spread of information.

The greater specialization of Nancy's actions also refers to a method of selecting partners. Nancy, when choosing a foreign partner, is guided by its own potential and the partner's potential. According to the office representatives, the greater number of common points, the more areas for exchange and more effective cooperation are. It's important that both cities have advantages and opportunities to help themselves. Importantly, there are also economic and human resources in the partner office. Professional staff allows to carry out more specialized activities. Before the Nancy decides to cooperate with the foreign city, it's looking for information on a future partner (prepared analysis of its economic, social, cultural and demographic situation in origin countries of partners and the partners). In the case of Lublin, the potential is important, but not the most important factor of cooperation. Polish city counts also on the benefits, it could be gained by cooperation and the possibility of implementation of Lublin's vision and its self-interest. Moreover, Lublin enters into relations with the cities, which organizations have been already working with various organizations from Lublin.

Nancy's authorities believe that cooperation has to be effective and active. The city is not afraid of termination of contracts with inactive partners. In 1996 Nancy broke the partnership agreement with the city of Piraeus in Greece, as they believe that this cooperation was becoming inconclusive. Cooperation between both cities had been intense until 1987. The first voices to break the agreement appeared at the Nancy's side in 1993. A careful selection of twin cities is a consequence of political choice of city authorities, in particular the mayor. In Nancy, there is a perception that: "It is better to do what we started, to strengthen, to build trust and friendship with existing partners". Nancy depends on carrying out in-depth cooperation, and this is impossible when you have a lot of partners. However, this finding does not affect the establishment of cooperation with numerous foreign cities with which cooperation is not formalized. In most cases, this is a one-time cooperation concerning

individual projects. There is, however, a list of cities with which Nancy cooperated intense in the same period of time (implemented in numerous projects related to the students exchange, cultural and economic projects), but with whom no agreement was signed. In some cases (e.g. San Francisco) proposal to formalize the partnership came from the foreign city, but in the end, the agreement wouldn't be signed. French city is also monitoring closely the situation in their partners. Numerous documents relating to cross-border cooperation in the Archives in many different years reflect about thorough analysis of the situation in the partner cities. For example, in 1992 Cooperation with Newcastle was limited due to the financial difficulties of British city. The collaboration with Kiryat Shmona froze in 2001 because of the political situation in Israel. Interruption of cooperation causes a complete abandonment of joint activities, but still maintained a permanent contact between departments involved in international cooperation in both cities. Since 2000 Nancy had noticed a lack of dynamism in relations with Padua and wanted to return to cooperation in the fields of transport, tourism and the development of green areas, but in 2004 common shares were still limited.

In Lublin, despite the existence of several inactive twinnings, there is a perception that there are no tools to break up agreements concluded for an indefinite period, and it is "inelegant" and inappropriate. The Lublin City Hall representative says that sometimes after a period of "dormant cooperation", relations become active again. An example is the collaboration with Rishon Le Zion (Israel), which is characterized by cyclical inactivity in cooperation, and collaboration with the city of Alcala de Henares (Spain). Relations with Spanish city, after a short period of intensive cooperation, disappeared with the change of Spanish city's authority. Cooperation froze due to a lack of interest at the Spanish city's side. In recent times, regardless of government offices, educational institutions from Lublin and Alcala de Henares have established cooperation. Currently, the two offices support the cooperation among schools. My interlocutors admitted, moreover, that the list of foreign partners is too broad and, in retrospect, Lublin would chose better its partners. An example is Chinese cities. Twin relations and the signing of letters of intent with Chinese cities were initiated by the department dealt with investor's support in the Lublin City Hall. Currently, international cooperation with Chinese partners does not exist, which is the outcome of insufficient knowledge on the realities in China, with huge differences in the organizational and the political local government system. In addition, a significant number of foreign partners, sometimes forces Lublin to make choices regarding proposed by partners projects.

It is important for effective cooperation at the local level to create specialized tools which could be used in the international cooperation activities. This cooperation enables gain

experience, which then can be used at international level [on the basis of Dziemianowicz, Swianiewicz, 2007]. Active and comprehensive cooperation of Nancy with neighbouring municipalities, translates, among others, on the will and ease to join entities located throughout agglomeration to the cross-border cooperation. Nancy cooperates with its neighbouring municipalities, creating agglomeration Le Grand Nancy. The cooperation within the Grand Nancy is complex. This applies public services, urban planning, culture, environmental protection and education. Municipalities and organizations (mainly entrepreneurs) from the Grand Nancy are "drawn" of international cooperation of Nancy. If the trader or other organizations want to cooperate with the Nancy's twin city or another entity located in it, their representatives (the organization or entrepreneur) and the mayor of this municipality are included in the official delegation of Nancy. Moreover, French city cooperates with the Regional Chamber of Commerce, which allows for a direct contact of entrepreneurs, interested in investing in origin countries of twin cities, with the City Hall. It is worth saying the city is open for new actors in international cooperation. Nancy is very eager to create a network of cooperation among with the whole agglomeration Le Grand Nancy or its individual municipalities. In Nancy, there is a perception that local experience of cooperation become the basis for international cooperation.

However, in the Lublin local cooperation is not so developed, it concerns above all the so-called "hard" areas (eg. infrastructure). Recently, as a result of the introduction of new rules for EU funds, Lublin has signed an agreement with representatives of 15 neighbouring municipalities belong to the Lublin Functional Area, which involved the preparation and implementation of the so-called "Integrated Territorial Investment" (ITI). The ITI Partnership enables joint acquisition of EU funds. The city does not draw in their international activities entities operating in the Functional Area of Lublin. Moreover, it's visible a separate treatment of local and international cooperation.

The shape of cross-border cooperation and adopted by cities is also affected by the financial factor. In the Lublin's budget, international activities are classified to the area of promotion. Therefore, the main goal of action is the city promotion through cross-border cooperation. International activity, on a decreasing scale, is financed by the city with its own funds. Cooperation is financed primarily from external resources such as: European Union funds, grants from various institutions, including MFA or foundations operating on a national level. Without external funding, Lublin have carried out 30% of activities that are carried out now. When it comes to the principles of financing international cooperation in Nancy, it is financed

with its own funds and funds come from various foundations. Specific projects, mostly large, are financed with subsidies from the ministry and EU funds.

In French and Polish city, cross-border cooperation is financed from the same sources. This what differentiates these two cities is the share of individual measures. In Lublin, my interlocutor pointed out that the share of external funds in the financing of international activities is growing from year to year.

The outline of the executive body- comparison

The results of the cities' studies have shown that the political factor, to the greatest extent, determines actions undertaken within the framework of cross-border cooperation. The executive authority (identified in the literature like the local leader [Klimska, Swianiewicz, 2003]) is a key figure who influences the cities' attitudes in the international arena. Both French mayor as well as Polish mayors are figures whose the vision of city development and policy determines international cooperation. They are responsible for cooperation, forming its framework for defining, among others, directions and areas of intensification of international cooperation. Changes in international cooperation, in both cities were connected with changes of thinking and adopted foreign policy priorities of the city by the mayor. An important position of executive body confirms also by the analysis of legal acts relating to the position of the executive body in Polish and French local government. What is important to notice, is the fact that for international actions the dominant position of the city mayor is essential. A lot of factors strengthen the overall position of executive body in Polish and French local governments, but in the context of international cooperation, we often do not see the direct impact of each other e.g. the dual position of the mayor in French local government strengthens its position in the local system, but it's not observed a relation between the scope of the rights and obligations arising from this phenomenon and actions in the international arena.

Are Municipal Offices learning organizations?

The study found the administration factor is the second one in importance of an influencing factor on the attitudes of municipal governments in cross-border cooperation. The administration, in Lublin and Nancy, is responsible for carrying out tasks related to international cooperation. As indicated by theories concerning international cooperation [see Szromnik 2008; Baldersheim, Stahlberg 1999] to be able to develop cooperation, it's required, on the one hand, efficient organizational structure of local administration, on the other - internalization of knowledge about cooperation in the office. The internalisation of knowledge about cooperation in the office makes the involvement of the entire office in the process of

international cooperation and creates an attitude of open and focused on its taking [Szmigiel-Rawska, Dołzbłasz, 2012].

Both City Halls are dealing with cooperation inside of the office, as well as the flow of knowledge. However, analyzing the range of international projects and tools used by French City Office in international cooperation and the way of its internal organization of implementation of international projects, we can say that the City Hall of Nancy has more features of learning organization than the City Office in Lublin. This fact allowed for fully exploiting benefits of internalization of knowledge. Nancy has developed and uses a wider range of tools for cross-border cooperation, than Lublin, that allows for active participation and involvement of residents in the international activities of the city. Residents of the city are co-creators of international action of French city, and not just their customers, as it is in Polish city.

The financial factor and international cooperation

Among the factors analyzed in this article, the financial factor has a minimal impact on cities' posture in cross-border cooperation. Analyzing the structure of the financing of international activities of Lublin can be seen an annual increase in importance of external funds in financing cross-border cooperation of the city. The officials of Lublin say that without external funding, the city would carry out only approx. 30% of current international efforts. Lublin implements many transnational projects and is active in the international arena, despite committing less its own financial resources. The phenomenon of the high share of external funds in their activities by local authorities in Poland is widespread. The growing importance of external funds in activities of Polish local governments support the research on importance of EU funds for local development [Satoła 2009, 2009]. They show addiction of poorer units to flow of funds from the European Union and the relation between wealth and acquiring EU funds [Satoła 2009, 2009].

In the context of international activities, it's also recognized dependence on external funding. PHARE CBC survey results showed that municipalities decide to take cooperation due to available financial resources. These measures are not usually seen by local governments as money to cooperate, but as a means to modernization and development of the municipality. The result is that local government units in Poland are liable to chances of the use of external resources, regardless of the compliance goals of the organization providing money and the recipients of these funds - municipalities. Importance of external financing in collaboration indicates the convergence between the dynamics in partnerships and the availability of external funds [Szmigiel-Rawska, Dołzbłasz, 2012].

Financial issues are an important determinant of the cooperation. However, this is not the factor most affecting the attitudes of local governments in the international arena. To conduct the same level of wealth of the community cooperation is not the most important, because local government units, as examples show, are able to finance international cooperation by external funds, mainly from the European Union. The effectiveness in obtaining external financing is linked with the efficiency of administrative activities in the community. Another problem is the question of whether present in Poland addition to external resources (EU) in the context of cooperation is a positive phenomenon? In my opinion - no. Instrumental use of partnerships as a means to gain additional funding will "flatten" the idea of cooperation, and what entails incomplete use of the opportunities generated by international cooperation.

Summary

The literature recognizes the success of international partnership depends on the two-dimensional management of international relations. Officials and politicians should be involved in international activities. Only one side participation causes a lack of appropriate rank or ceremonial character of cross-border cooperation [Szmigiel-Rawska, Dołzbłasz, 2012]. In both analyzed cities officials and the mayor are involving in collaboration. Despite differences in local governments' system and legal acts, the analysis of attitudes of Nancy and Lublin show that the greatest factor in shaping cities' attitudes in cross-border cooperation is a political factor, in particular the executive authority. The local government authority is identified with a local leader. The person of leader is inextricably linked to the issue of leadership. According to leadership theories, it is the subject of a leader to set goals, to meet the needs of groups, from which it depends on and reacts to changes [Tucker, 1981]. Both in Nancy and Lublin, executive authority is a major player and sets the objectives and priorities of cross-border cooperation of the city, thus affecting the cities' attitudes in international cooperation.

Another influencing factor on the city's attitude is administration. Because of the responsibility for the execution of tasks related to cross-border activities of the city, which is under the City Office responsibility, it is important to execute in efficient and high-quality manners all duties by officials. The comparison of principles of City Halls' functioning and the scope of services provided by, in the context of international cooperation, shows that in both cities are dealing with learning organizations. However, the office of Nancy is more developed and advanced organization than in Lublin. The learning organization theory and founded on its basis, the theory of learning region highlight importance of knowledge, its flow and the process of cooperation for achieving development. Exchange of information and

dissemination of knowledge between different departments in the organization or actors in the region, and as well as cooperation between them, ensures: better quality of activities or services, better adjustment of organization's activities to needs of its clients, and an achievement of better results. This process allows for the education of new, innovative ideas and tools, and gaining new experience.

Research has shown the financial factor in the slightest way, among those analyzed one in the article, affects international cooperation of local governments. An example of Polish local government shows that international action can be financed from external sources. Thus, this factor rather does not affect, in a decisive way, the attitude of local authorities in cooperation.

Bibliography:

- Baldersheim H., Stahlberg K. (1999), *Nordic region building in a European perspective*, Vermont
- Blondel J. (1987), *Political Leadership. Towards a general analysis*, London
- Bober J., Hausner J., Izdebski H., Lachniewicz W., Mazur S., Nielicki A., Nowotarski B., Puzyna W., Surówka K., Zachariasz I., Zawicki M. (2013), *Raport o stanie samorządności terytorialnej w Polsce*, Kraków
- Borraz O. (2000), *Le gouvernement municipal en France : un modèle d'intégration en recomposition*, Pole Sud, No. 13 - 2000
- Brzozowska A. (1998), *Związki bliźniacze. Współpraca międzynarodowa samorządów lokalnych.*, Poznań
- Cieśla S. (2000), *Globalizacja i metropolizacja. Niektóre aspekty badań polskiej przestrzeni.*, Studia Regionalne i Lokalne No. 4(4)/2000
- Clarke N. (2010), *Town twinning in Cold- War Britain: (Dis)continuities in twentieth-century municipal internationalism*, Contemporary British History 24(2):173-91
- Dziemianowicz W., Swianiewicz P. (2007), *Gmina pasywna*, Warszawa
- Fuksiewicz A., Łada A., Wenerski Ł. (2012), *Współpraca zagraniczna polskich samorządów.*, Warszawa
- Galata S. (2004), *Strategiczne zarządzanie organizacjami.*, Warszawa
- Gendźwiłł A., Żóltak T. (2012), *Bezpartyjni w powolnym odwróceniu. Analiza rozpowszechnienia bezpartyjności w wyborach lokalnych w Polsce w latach 2002-2010.*, Studia Regionalne i Lokalne No. 1(47)/2012,
- Hałas K., Porawski A. (2003), *Miasta i gminy bliźniacze*, Urząd Komitetu Integracji Europejskiej,
- Hermann M.G. (1998), *Elementy przywództwa*, [in] Szczupaczyński J., *Władza i społeczeństwo* 2, Warszawa
- John P., Cole A. (2000), *Political Leadership in the Urban Governance: Britain and France compared*, [in] Pratchett L., *Democracy? The modernization agenda in British Local Government*, Frank Cass & Co Ltd.
- Kersting N., Vetter A. (2003), *Reforming Local Government in Europe. Closing the Gap between Democracy and Efficiency*, Leske+Budrich, Opladen
- Kocot D. (2006), *Cechy i struktura organizacji "uczącej się"*, e-Fakty 3/2006, <http://www.logistyka.net.pl/images/articles/4565/e-F2006-3s10.pdf> (10.05.2014)
- Konstańczak S. (2001), *Internalizacja wartości moralnych*, Słupsk
- Kotras M. (2008), *Obrazy przywództwa politycznego na poziomie regionalnym*, Folia Sociologica 33,

- *Leksykon PWN* (1972), Warszawa
- Martin P. (2001), *Les élections municipales en France depuis 1945*, Paris
- Mintrom M., Norman P. (2009), *Policy Entrepreneurship and Policy Change*, *The Policy Studies Journal*, Vol. 37, No. 4, 2009
- Ptak A. (2011), *Rywalizacja polityczna w samorządach lokalnych. Studium wybranych gmin.*, Poznań-Kalisz
- Satoła Ł. (2009), *Finansowe wspieranie budżetów gmin wybranymi funduszami strukturalnymi Unii Europejskiej*, *Rocznik Nauk Rolniczych, Seria G*, T. 96, z. 3
- Satoła Ł. (2009), *Znaczenie funduszy UE we wspieraniu rozwoju lokalnego*, *Oeconomia* 8 (1) 2009,
- Stoner J.A.F., Freeman R.E., Gilbert, JR. D.R. (2001), *Kierowanie*, Warszawa
- Swianiewicz P., Klimska U. (2003), *Kto rządzi gminą i jak? Lokalni liderzy polityczni w teorii i praktyce samorządów w Polsce.*, *Studia Regionalne i Lokalne* No. 4(14)/2003,
- Szewczyk J. (2007), *Zagraniczne związki partnerskie polskich samorządów miast, powiatów i województw*, *Prace geograficzne*, volume 117, Kraków
- Szmigiel - Rawska K. (2008), *Relacje, konkurencja, współpraca. Próby znalezienia właściwych definicji dla działań podejmowanych na arenie międzynarodowej przez regiony administracyjne. Przekształcenia regionalnych struktur funkcjonalno-przestrzennych. Europa bez granic.*
- Szmigiel - Rawska K., Dołzbłasz S. (2012), *Trwałość współpracy przygranicznej*, Warszawa
- Szmigiel - Rawska K., Dziemianowicz W., Szlachta J. (2010), *Samorząd lokalny w sieciach gospodarczych*, Warszawa
- Szromnik A. (2008), *Marketing terytorialny*, Warszawa
- Tucker R. C. (1981), *Politics as Leadership*, Columbia
- Urban U. (2006), *Francja: między centralizacją a rozwojem collectivités locales*, *Społeczeństwo i Polityka* No. 1 (6)/2006,
- Vital-Durand E. (2000), *Les collectivités locales en France*, Paris
- Wollmann H. (2000), *Local government systems: from historic divergence towards convergence? Great Britain, France and Germany as comparative cases in point*, *Environment and Planning C: Government and Policy*, volume 18, 2000
- Wollmann H. (2012), *Local Government Reforms in (seven) European Countries: between Convergent and Divergent, conflicting and complementary developments*, *Local Government Studies* vol. 38, No. 1, February 2012
- Wollmann H., Bouckaert G. (2006), *State Organization in France and Germany between Territoriality and Functionality*, [in] Hoffmann-Martinot V., Wollmann H., *State and Local Governments Reforms in France and Germany. Divergence and Convergence.*, Vs. Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften
- Wójtowicz D. (2008), *Decentralizacja władzy publicznej we Francji w drugiej połowie XX wieku*, Katowice
- Constitution de la République française
<http://libr.sejm.gov.pl/tek01/txt/konst/francja.html>
- Code générale des collectivités territoriales (CGCT)
<http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006070633>
- La loi Oudin – Sautini (7.12.2006)
- La loi de Thiolliere (2007)
- Circulaire INT/A/91 00 108 C
- Circulaire NOR/INT/B/01/00124/C (21.04.2001)

- CirculaireNOR/INT/B/01/00124/C bis (20.04.2001)
- Konstytucja RP z dn. 2 kwietnia 1997r. Dz. U. 1997 nr 78 poz. 483
- Ustawa z 20 czerwca 2002r. o bezpośrednim wyborze wójta, burmistrza i prezydenta miasta Dz.U. 2002 Nr 113 poz. 984
- Ustawa z dnia 15 września 2000r. o referendum lokalnym Dz.U. 2000 nr 88 poz. 985
- Ustawa z dnia 8 maja 1990r. o samorządzie gminnym Dz.U.2013.594
- Lublin's web site: <http://www.um.lublin.pl> (5.04.2014)
- Nancy's web site: <http://www1.nancy.fr> (12.11.2013)